### UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

USDC Docket Number: 05-cv-10908

Kenneth M. Kansky

v.

Coca-Cola Bottling Company

#### **CLERK'S CERTIFICATE**

I, Sarah A. Thornton, Clerk of the United States District Court for the District of Massachusetts, do hereby certify that the annexed documents numbered:

1-19, 23-41

and contained in Volume(s) I are the original or electronically filed pleadings and constitute the record on appeal in the above entitled case for the Notice of Appeal filed on 6/1/2006.

In testimony whereof, I hereunto set my hand and affix the seal of this Court on July 6, 2006. Sarah A Thornton, Clerk of Court Receipt of the documents in the above entitled case is hereby acknowledged this date: Please complete the following information:

COURT OF APPEALS DOCKET NUMBER ASSIGNED:

**APPEAL** 

# United States District Court District of Massachusetts (Boston) CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:05-cv-10908-DPW

Kansky v. Coca Cola Bottling of Northern New

England . et al

Assigned to: Judge Douglas P. Woodlock

Cause: 29:1001 E.R.I.S.A.: Employee Retirement

Date Filed: 05/03/2005 Jury Demand: Plaintiff Nature of Suit: 791 Labor:

E.R.I.S.A.

Jurisdiction: Federal Question

**Plaintiff** 

Kenneth M. Kansky

represented by Bernard A. Kansky

Law Office of Bernard A. Kansky

and Associates

468 Commercial Street Boston, MA 02109-1020

617-227-2020 Fax: 617-227-5717

Email: berakan@aol.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

**Defendant** 

Coca Cola Bottling of Northern

New England.

represented by Stephen D. Rosenberg

The McCormack Firm, LLC

One International Place

7th Floor

Boston, MA 02110-0140

617-951-2929

Fax: 617-951-2672

Email:

srosenberg@mccormackfirm.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Defendant** 

Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc.

represented by Stephen D. Rosenberg

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

### Defendant

Coca Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan a/k/a Core LTD Benefits

represented by Stephen D. Rosenberg (See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Filed 07/07/2006

## **Defendant**

**Aetna Life Insurance Company** 

represented by Stephen D. Rosenberg (See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

| Date Filed | #        | Docket Text   |
|------------|----------|---|
| 05/03/2005 | 1        | COMPLAINT against Coca Cola Bottling of Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance Company Filing fee: \$ 250, receipt number 63931, filed by Kenneth M. Kansky. (Attachments: # 1 Cover Sheet)(Nici, Richard) (Entered: 05/04/2005) |
| 05/03/2005 | 3        | If the trial Judge issues an Order of Reference of any matter in this case to a Magistrate Judge, the matter will be transmitted to Magistrate Judge Collings. (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 05/04/2005)  |
| 05/03/2005 | 3        | Summons Issued as to Coca Cola Bottling of Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance Company. (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 05/04/2005)   |
| 05/20/2005 | <b>2</b> | Letter/request for additional summonses(non-motion) from Kansky. (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 05/23/2005)  |
| 06/06/2005 | •3       | STIPULATION regarding additional time for defendants to answer or otherwise plead by Kenneth M. Kansky, Coca Cola Bottling of Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance Company. (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 06/07/2005)              |

| 06/06/2005 | <b>2</b> 4  | NOTICE of Appearance by Stephen D. Rosenberg on behalf of Coca Cola Bottling of Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance Company (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 06/07/2005)   |
|------------|-------------|---|
| 06/17/2005 | <b>(</b> 5) | CERTIFICATE OF CONSULTATION by Stephen D. Rosenberg on behalf of Coca Cola Bottling of Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance Company. (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 06/22/2005)   |
| 06/17/2005 | 6           | MOTION to Strike Jury Demand by Coca Cola Bottling of<br>Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca<br>Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life<br>Insurance Company.(Nici, Richard) (Entered: 06/22/2005)  |
| 06/17/2005 | <b>6</b> 7  | MEMORANDUM in Support re <u>6</u> MOTION to Strike filed by Coca Cola Bottling of Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance Company. (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 06/22/2005)  |
| 06/17/2005 | <b>8</b>    | MOTION to Dismiss Count IV by Coca Cola Bottling of<br>Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca<br>Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life<br>Insurance Company.(Nici, Richard) (Entered: 06/22/2005)  |
| 06/17/2005 | <b>6</b> 9  | MEMORANDUM in Support re <u>8</u> MOTION to Dismiss filed by Coca Cola Bottling of Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance Company. (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 06/22/2005)   |
| 06/17/2005 | 10          | ANSWER to Complaint by Coca Cola Bottling of Northern<br>New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola<br>Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance<br>Company.(Nici, Richard) (Entered: 06/22/2005)   |
| 06/20/2005 | 3           | Judge Douglas P. Woodlock: Electronic ORDER entered.ORDER REQUIRING ELECTRONIC FILING. It is hereby ORDERED that, unless leave is granted, upon good cause shown, to file paper documents in lieu of electronic filing via this Court's CM/ECF system, ALL future submissions in this case must be electronically filed. Such filings shall be made in accordance with, and subject to, the |

|            |             | terms and conditions of electronic filing as set forth by this Court. All parties and counsel who choose to appear in this action must make arrangements to register for participation in electronic case filing, if they have not already done so. It is FURTHER ORDERED that Notices, Orders and Memoranda of the Court will only be filed and served electronically. Once a party or counsel has registered for electronic filing, it is his/her responsibility to monitor his/her e-mail to ensure receipt of electronic notices. Any changes in e-mail addresses must be reported to the Court immediately (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 06/20/2005) |
|------------|-------------|---|
| 07/06/2005 |             | MEMORANDUM in Opposition re <u>6</u> MOTION to Strike, <u>8</u> MOTION to Dismiss filed by Kenneth M. Kansky. (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 07/07/2005)   |
| 07/07/2005 | 12          | NOTICE of Scheduling Conference: Scheduling Conference set for 8/23/2005 03:00 PM in Courtroom 1 before Judge Douglas P. Woodlock. (Rynne, Michelle) (Entered: 07/07/2005)  |
| 08/22/2005 | <u>13</u>   | CERTIFICATE OF CONSULTATION by Stephen D. Rosenberg on behalf of Coca Cola Bottling of Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance Company. (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 08/26/2005)   |
| 08/23/2005 | •           | Judge Douglas P. Woodlock: Electronic ORDER entered granting 6 Motion to Strike, granting 8 Motion to Dismiss. Allowed at hearing this date. (Rynne, Michelle) (Entered: 08/23/2005)  |
| 08/23/2005 | •           | Electronic Clerk's Notes for proceedings held before Judge Douglas P. Woodlock: Scheduling Conference held on 8/23/2005. Motion to dismiss- ALLOWED; Motion to strike - ALLOWED; Administrative record shall be provided to the plaintiff no later than 9/30/05; motion/cross-motion for summary judgment by 10/30/05. (Court Reporter Pam Owens.) (Rynne, Michelle) (Entered: 08/23/2005)  |
| 09/27/2005 | <b>Q</b> 14 | NOTICE of Change of Address by Stephen D. Rosenberg (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 09/28/2005)   |
| 10/05/2005 | <b>(13)</b> | CERTIFICATE OF CONSULTATION by Stephen D. Rosenberg on behalf of Coca Cola Bottling of Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola Enterprises  |

|            |            | Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance Company. (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 10/06/2005)   |
|------------|------------|--|
| 10/10/2005 | <b>1</b> 6 | Judge Douglas P. Woodlock: ORDER entered. SCHEDULING ORDER: Motions due by 10/30/2005.(Rynne, Michelle) (Entered: 10/10/2005)  |
| 10/20/2005 | 17         | Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to November 30, 2005 to file summary judgment motions by Coca Cola Bottling of Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance Company.(Rosenberg, Stephen) (Entered: 10/20/2005) |
| 10/24/2005 | 3          | Judge Douglas P. Woodlock: ElectronicORDER entered granting 17 Motion for Extension of Time summary judgment motions. Motions due 11/30/05. (Rynne, Michelle) (Entered: 10/24/2005)  |
| 10/24/2005 | 3          | Set/Reset Scheduling Order Deadlines: Motions due by 11/30/2005. (Rynne, Michelle) (Entered: 10/24/2005)   |
| 11/30/2005 | <b>18</b>  | MOTION for Summary Judgment by Coca Cola Bottling of Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance Company. (Attachments: # 1)(Rosenberg, Stephen) (Entered: 11/30/2005)   |
| 11/30/2005 | 20         | MOTION for Summary Judgment by Kenneth M. Kansky. FILED UNDER SEAL(Nici, Richard) (Entered: 12/02/2005)  |
| 11/30/2005 | 21         | MEMORANDUM in Support re [20] MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Kenneth M. Kansky. FILED UNDER SEAL (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 12/02/2005)   |
| 12/01/2005 |            | Joint MOTION to Seal Document and impound summary judgment filings by Coca Cola Bottling of Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance Company. (Rosenberg, Stephen) (Entered: 12/01/2005)                      |
| 12/01/2005 | 22         | MEMORANDUM in Support re 18 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Coca Cola Bottling of Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance Company. FILED UNDER SEAL (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 12/02/2005)               |
|            |            |  |

| 12/01/2005 | (23)        | STATEMENT of facts re 18 MOTION for Summary Judgment includes appendix. FILED UNDER SEAL (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 12/02/2005)  |
|------------|-------------|---|
| 12/01/2005 | 24          | TRANSCRIPT (Administrative Record). (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 12/02/2005)   |
| 12/02/2005 | •           | Judge Douglas P. Woodlock: Electronic ORDER entered granting 19 Motion to Seal Document (Rynne, Michelle) (Entered: 12/02/2005)   |
| 12/12/2005 | 25          | MEMORANDUM in Opposition re [20] MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Kenneth M. Kansky. FILED UNDER SEAL (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 12/14/2005)   |
| 12/15/2005 | <b>9</b> 26 | MEMORANDUM in Opposition re [20] MOTION for<br>Summary Judgment filed by Coca Cola Bottling of Northern<br>New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola<br>Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance<br>Company. (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 12/15/2005)  |
| 01/12/2006 | <b>9</b> 27 | MOTION for Leave to File Reply Memorandum by Coca Cola Bottling of Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance Company.(Nici, Richard) FILED UNDER SEAL (Entered: 01/13/2006)   |
| 01/12/2006 | 28          | REPLY to Response to Motion re 18 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Coca Cola Bottling of Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance Company. (Nici, Richard)FILED UNDER SEAL (Entered: 01/13/2006)   |
| 01/12/2006 | 29          | MOTION to Strike [25] Memorandum in Opposition to Motion by Coca Cola Bottling of Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance Company.(Nici, Richard) FILED UNDER SEAL (Entered: 01/13/2006)  |
| 01/12/2006 | (30)        | MEMORANDUM in Support re [29] MOTION to Strike [25] Memorandum in Opposition to Motion filed by Coca Cola Bottling of Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance Company. FILED UNDER SEAL (Nici, Richard) including certificate of service. (Entered: 01/13/2006) |
| 01/17/2006 | •           | Judge Douglas P. Woodlock: Electronic ORDER entered   |

|            |             | granting [27] Motion for Leave to File reply, granting [27] Sealed Motion. (Rynne, Michelle) (Entered: 01/17/2006)  |
|------------|-------------|---|
| 01/19/2006 | <b>9</b> 31 | Plaintiff's supplementation of his motion for Summary Judgment and MEMORANDUM in Opposition re 18 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Kenneth M. Kansky. (Nici, Richard)FILED UNDER SEAL (Entered: 01/19/2006)   |
| 01/27/2006 | <b>4</b> 32 | MEMORANDUM in Opposition re [27] MOTION for Leave to File SEALED MOTION filed by Kenneth M. Kansky. (Nici, Richard)FILED UNDER SEAL AND NOT SCANNED (Entered: 01/30/2006)   |
| 01/30/2006 | •           | NOTICE of Hearing on Motion [20] MOTION for Summary Judgment, [29] MOTION to Strike [25] Memorandum in Opposition to Motion, 18 MOTION for Summary Judgment: Motion Hearing set for 4/12/2006 02:30 PM in Courtroom 1 before Judge Douglas P. Woodlock. (Rynne, Michelle) (Entered: 01/30/2006)   |
| 03/08/2006 | •           | NOTICE of Rescheduling Hearing on Motion [20] MOTION for Summary Judgment, [29] MOTION to Strike [25] Memorandum in Opposition to Motion, 18 MOTION for Summary Judgment: Motion Hearing reset for 4/26/2006 02:30 PM in Courtroom 1 before Judge Douglas P. Woodlock. (Rynne, Michelle) (Entered: 03/08/2006)  |
| 04/26/2006 | •           | ElectronicClerk's Notes for proceedings held before Judge Douglas P. Woodlock: Motion Hearing held on 4/26/2006 re [20] MOTION for Summary Judgment, [29] MOTION to Strike [25] Memorandum in Opposition to Motion, 18 MOTION for Summary Judgment. Motions taken under advisement. (Court Reporter Pam Owens.) (Rynne, Michelle) (Entered: 04/27/2006) |
| 05/01/2006 | (33)        | Judge Douglas P. Woodlock: MEMORANDUM AND ORDER entered granting 18 Motion for Summary Judgment, denying [20] Motion for Summary Judgment, granting in part and denying in part [29] Motion to Strike (Woodlock, Douglas) (Entered: 05/02/2006)   |
| 05/02/2006 | <b>43</b> 4 | Judge Douglas P. Woodlock: ORDER entered. JUDGMENT in favor of defendants against plaintiff.(Rynne, Michelle) (Entered: 05/02/2006)   |

| 05/10/2006 | First MOTION to Alter Judgment <i>Or Amend Judgment Pursuant to Rule 59(e) By The Plaintiff</i> by Kenneth M. Kansky.(Kansky, Bernard) (Entered: 05/10/2006)  |
|------------|---|
| 05/19/2006 | Supplemental MOTION for Rule 59(e) Relief and to Vacate Memorandum, Judgment and Orders and the Orders Realted to the Parties' Motions For Summary Judgment Dated May 1, 2006 and Docketed May 2, 2006 And For Remand to United States Magistrate or to the Court's Alternative Dispute Resolution Program by Kenneth M. Kansky.(Kansky, Bernard) (Entered: 05/19/2006)   |
| 05/24/2006 | Opposition re <u>35</u> First MOTION to Alter Judgment <i>Or Amend Judgment Pursuant to Rule 59(e) By The Plaintiff</i> filed by Coca Cola Bottling of Northern New England., Coca Cola Enterprises, Inc., Coca Cola Enterprises Long-Term Disability Plan, Aetna Life Insurance Company. (Brodie, Eric) (Entered: 05/24/2006)  |
| 06/01/2006 | REPLY to Response to Motion re 35 First MOTION to Alter Judgment Or Amend Judgment Pursuant to Rule 59(e) By The Plaintiff filed by Kenneth M. Kansky. (Kansky, Bernard) (Entered: 06/01/2006)  |
| 06/01/2006 | NOTICE OF APPEAL as to 34 Judgment by Kenneth M. Kansky. \$ 455 NOTICE TO COUNSEL: A Transcript Report/Order Form, which can be downloaded from the First Circuit Court of Appeals web site at http://www.ca1.uscourts.gov/clerks/transcript.htm MUST be completed and submitted to the Court of Appeals. Appeal Record due by 6/21/2006. (Kansky, Bernard) (Entered: 06/01/2006)   |
| 06/05/2006 | Judge Douglas P. Woodlock: Electronic MEMORANDUM AND ORDER entered denying 35 Motion to Alter Judgment, denying 36 Motion to vacate and remand. Through these motions the plaintiff seeks to reargue the motion for summary judgment decided adversely to him. The arguments presented were all considered in substance before final judgment was entered and do not require any further discussion, save one: plaintiff's complaint about reference in my opinion, 5/1/06 Memorandum and Order at 31-33, to an Annals of Medicine article that was not itself expressly made part of the administrative record. There is considerable irony in plaintiff's current complaint about the reference since it was he who |

|            |    | invited it by urging that I engage in careful consideration of the resolution of Houle v. Raytheon Co., Civ. No. 00-12071-NG. Understanding of Magistrate Judge Dein's Report and Recommendation in Houle necessitated review of the Annals article because it played a significant role in her Report and Recommendation, see slip op. at 20-21 n.10, 36-40 (D.Mass. April 28, 2003), which was adopted by Judge Gertner. As is apparent from my own reference to the article, I considered it to evaluate - as plaintiff requested - the reasonableness of Aetna's actions in this case against the arguments about assertedly similar cases, such as Houle, pressed as persuasive by the plaintiff at oral argument. Moreover, as I noted in my opinion, 5/1/06 Memo and Order at 21 and nn. 11 & 12, the article is apparently "the basis for the comments of Drs. Bell, Burton, and DeFoy [in this case] to the effect that Kansky cannot be diagnosed according to the current research criteria put out by the Centers for Disease Control." (Woodlock, Douglas) (Entered: 06/05/2006) |
|------------|----|---|
| 06/07/2006 | 40 | MOTION for Reconsideration re 35 First MOTION to Alter Judgment <i>Or Amend Judgment Pursuant to Rule 59(e) By The Plaintiff</i> by Kenneth M. Kansky.(Kansky, Bernard) (Entered: 06/07/2006)   |
| 06/07/2006 | •  | Receipt #72942 \$455 for Notice of Appeal. (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 06/12/2006)  |
| 06/07/2006 | 41 | Letter/request (non-motion) from Bernard Kansky. (Nici, Richard) (Entered: 06/13/2006)  |
| 06/08/2006 | •  | Judge Douglas P. Woodlock: Electronic ORDER entered denying 40 Motion for Reconsideration (Woodlock, Douglas) (Entered: 06/08/2006)   |
| 06/20/2006 | 42 | Amended Subsequent NOTICE OF APPEAL by Kenneth M. Kansky <i>Plaintiff</i> . Filing fee \$ 455. Appeal Record due by 7/10/2006. (Kansky, Bernard) (Entered: 06/20/2006)  |